



0 **Jury orders Johnson & Johnson pay \$11 million to plaintiff in vaginal mesh lawsuit**

1
 Tweet
 8
 Like
 0
 Share
 Foursquare
 Email

 (<http://connect.nj.com/user/njobloomberg/index.html>) By **Bloomberg News**
 (<http://connect.nj.com/user/njobloomberg/posts.html>)
 on February 28, 2013 at 12:18 PM, updated February 28, 2013 at 12:37 PM
 Print (http://blog.nj.com/business_impact/print.html?entry=2013/02/post_260.html)

A jury today ruled Johnson & Johnson must pay \$7.76 million in punitive damages to a woman who previously won a **\$3.35 million compensatory**



Bloomberg News

Sponsored By:



(http://ads.nj.com/RealMedia/ads/click_ix.ads/www.nj.com/business/2013/)

Where business meets real estate in New Jersey.

CUSHMAN & WAKEFIELD

EAST RUTHERORD One Meadowlands Plz 201-935-4000	MORRISTOWN 1150 Headquarters Plz 973-993-1200	EDISON 333 Thornall St. 732-623-4700
--	--	---

(http://ads.nj.com/RealMedia/ads/click_ix.ads/www.nj.com/business/2013/)

(http://www.nj.com/business/index.ssf/2013/02/jury_orders_johnson_johnson_pay.html) **N.J. News Essentials**
 award for injuries she blamed on the company's vaginal-mesh device.

Jurors in Atlantic City made the award to punish J&J, the world's largest seller of health-care products. The verdict came in the first of 4,000 lawsuits to go to trial over J&J's pelvic mesh, including 2,100 in New Jersey. The jury declined to comment on its decision.

The total of \$11.1 million goes to Linda Gross, a South Dakota nurse who complained of constant pain and underwent 18 operations after J&J's Gynecare Prolift was implanted to shore up weakened pelvic muscles.

Outside the courthouse following today's verdict, Gross said she felt "justice has been served. This sent a message that Johnson & Johnson can never do this again." Gross, who said she still has trouble walking, sitting and standing, added, "on behalf of the other women, I'm very happy to take first to step to help others."

On Monday, the panel found that J&J and its Ethicon unit failed to warn her surgeon of the risks of the device and fraudulently misled her about the risks.

"Tell them to tell the truth," Gross attorney Adam Slater argued to jurors on Tuesday. "Make sure you punish them for not telling the truth. Make sure you deter and discourage."

J&J, based in New Brunswick, claimed at trial that Prolift is safe and effective and that the company gave adequate warning of any risks associated with the device. Christy Jones, a J&J attorney, said the company hadn't acted with wanton and willful disregard to Gross, the legal standard required for punitive damages.

'Fell Short'

See top photos from The Star-Ledger
 (<http://photos.nj.com/star-ledger/index.html>)

Find fun events in New Jersey
 (<http://www.nj.com/events/repagetype=results&SearchKeyw>)

Search New Jersey business listings
 (<http://businessfinder.nj.com/1New-Brunswick>)

Most Comments Most Read

411 N.J. State Police trooper admits drunkenly crashing car into creek
 (http://nj.com/monmouth/index.ssf/2013/03/nj_state_police_trooper.html)
 comments

405 N.J. pension woes worsen, report says
 (http://nj.com/politics/index.ssf/2013/03/nj_pension_woes_worsen.html)
 comments

"I understand that you have found that we could have done a better job and that we in fact fell short," Jones said Tuesday. "My clients understand that. We hear you, I promise you."

Jones said that "while I confess to you from the bottom of my heart that it hurts, and we're disappointed in the verdict, we nonetheless appreciate what you have said and recognize and respect your verdict."

Gross's attorneys called a forensic economics expert, Frank Tinari, to testify about J&J's finances. Tinari said J&J had assets of \$121.3 billion and a net worth of \$64.8 billion through Dec. 31. Advertising and marketing expenses were \$20.9 billion last year, or \$57 million a day, he said.

Under questioning by Gross's attorney, David Mazie, Tinari said that every 45 minutes the company spends the equivalent of the \$3.35 million award to Gross on marketing and advertising.

A J&J manager of financial reporting, Mark Schneider, testified his analysis of Prolift sales from 2005 through 2012 showed the total was \$128 million and profit was \$5.6 million.

Company Document

On cross-examination, Mazie suggested Schneider's calculations were unreliable and underreported sales. He showed Schneider a company document saying sales in the first half of 2008 were \$55 million. Schneider said he hadn't seen it.

In his summation, Slater went through e-mails, memos and video depositions, including one of the device's creator, Axel Arnaud. Slater said Arnaud contradicted Ethicon's statement that Prolift posed "rare and small risks" of complications.

"I have given you 100 percent irrefutable evidence that you cannot reasonably say no to," Slater said. "This is clear and convincing evidence. This is irrefutable."

Jones said Ethicon tried to teach surgeons how to minimize the risk to patients, and sought through "instructions for use" to warn of the risks.

'That's Human'

The evidence doesn't show "J&J or Ethicon did not care about hurting women. And that's what the charge is," Jones told jurors, her hands held as if in prayer. "I'm asking you, indeed, I'm begging you, to think about what was done and why."

In his summation, Slater said, "They stood in front of you and said we're begging you. We're begging you. Every single day Linda Gross begs to be out of the prison that she's in of pain and all the things that have happened to her; every damn day. That's human. That's real."

Mazie said J&J is a "big giant" and jurors must send a "loud message" to punish the company for its conduct.

"It's for each and every one of you to send a message to them that this can never, ever happen again, because life and health is at risk," Mazie said. "You can send a message to Johnson & Johnson and Ethicon and tell them no more, no more, no more."

Star-Ledger staff writer Alexi Friedman contributed to this report.

Follow @ledgerbiz

(<http://www.nj.com/business/>)

MORE BUSINESS NEWS (<http://www.nj.com/business/>)
(<http://www.nj.com/business/>)

Tweet 1

Like 8

Share 0

Foursquare

Email

290 Newark Public Schools eliminates more than 100 administrative positions
(http://nj.com/news/index.ssf/2013/03/public_comments/)

267 Opinion: NRA knows that fear sells guns
(http://nj.com/times-opinion/index.ssf/2013/03/opinion_nra_knows_that_fear_se.htm)

222 Brunt of federal cuts to hit N.J. with furloughs, airport slowdowns and court closures
(http://nj.com/news/index.ssf/2013/03/brunt_of_federal_cuts_to_comments/)

See more comments »
(<http://www.nj.com/interact/>)

GH GEBROE-HAMMER
ASSOCIATES
INVESTMENT REAL ESTATE

**A Tradition of Integrity.
A Passion for Perfection**
Celebrating 38 Years in Business

2 West Northfield Road, Livingston, NJ
973-994-4500
info@GebroeHammer.com

(http://ads.nj.com/RealMedia/ads/click_lx.ads/www.nj.com/business/2013.0208.html/524d646f336c453161686f4143656c43)

Add Your Comment

Sign in with your NJ.com or Facebook account (https://signup.nj.com/sign-in/?return_to=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.nj.com%2Fbusiness%2Findex.ssf%2F2013%2F02%2Fpost_260.html)

0 comments so far

Sort By:

Pause Live Updates »

There are no comments on this story yet.

Best of NJ.com

(<http://www.nj.com/news/index.ssf>)
of) Big storm will bring coastal flooding
(<http://www.nj.com/news/index.ssf>)
of)

(<http://www.nj.com/hssports/blog/>)
of) Brackets for N.J. HS wrestling tourney are out
(<http://www.nj.com/hssports/blog/>)
of)

(http://photos.nj.com/4505/gallery/1con_2013_/index.html#incart_hbx#inof)
of) PHOTOS: Hoboken's Lepre-Con
(http://photos.nj.com/4505/gallery/1con_2013_/index.html#incart_hbx#inof)
of)



About Us

About NJ.com (<http://www.nj.com/about-us/>)
Jobs at NJ.com (<http://www.nj.com/careers/company-detail/id/134004>)
Advertise with us (<http://www.nj.com/advertising/>)
Contact Us (<http://www.nj.com/contact-us/>)
Newsletters (http://update.nj.com/adv_nj/newsletters/nj/subscribe.html)
RSS feeds (<http://www.nj.com/rss/>)

More on NJ.com

Interact (<http://www.nj.com/interact/>)
Weather (<http://www.nj.com/weather/>)
Blogs (<http://www.nj.com/blogs/>)
Premium Blogs (<http://www.nj.com/blogs/premium/>)
Site map (<http://www.nj.com/site-map/>)
Claim your free business listing (<http://my.marketplaceads.com/registration/default.asp?m=800101&h=8&src=categories>)
Place an ad (<http://www.nj.com/placead/>)
Sell your car (<http://www.nj.com/placead/autos/>)
Sell/rent your home (<http://www.nj.com/placead/real-estate/>)
Post a job (<http://www.nj.com/jobs/products/index.ssf>)
Post a free classified ad (<http://www.nj.com/classifieds/>)
Become a blogger (<http://www.nj.com/contributors/blogger>)
Submit your photos (<http://photos.nj.com/photo-gallery/upload.html>)
Submit your videos (<https://signup.nj.com/register/>)
Submit an event (<http://videos.nj.com/upload-submit/>)

NJ.com Sections

N.J. News (<http://www.nj.com/news/>)
Local News (<http://www.nj.com/local/>)
Politics (<http://www.nj.com/politics/>)
Sports (<http://www.nj.com/sports/>)
High School Sports (<http://highschoolsports.nj.com/>)
Entertainment (<http://www.nj.com/entertainment/>)
Living (<http://www.nj.com/living/>)
Business (<http://www.nj.com/business/>)
Opinion (<http://www.nj.com/opinion/>)
Inside Jersey (<http://www.nj.com/inside-jersey/>)
Shore (<http://www.nj.com/shore/>)
Obituaries (<http://www.nj.com/obituaries/>)
Jobs (<http://www.nj.com/jobs/>)
Autos (<http://autos.nj.com/>)
Real Estate (<http://realestate.nj.com/>)
Rentals (<http://classifieds.nj.com/>)
Shopping Good Deals (<http://findsave.nj.com/>)
Local Businesses (<http://businessfinder.nj.com/>)
Special Sections (<http://sections.nj.com/SS/TitlePage>)

Contribute to NJ.com

Forums (<http://www.nj.com/forums/>)
Submit your photos (<http://photos.nj.com/photo-gallery/upload.html>)
Submit your videos (<https://signup.nj.com/register/>)
Submit an event (<http://videos.nj.com/upload-submit/>)
Register for free with blogger (http://www.nj.com/contributors/blogger_on_njcom_1.html)
Register for free with blogger (<https://signup.nj.com/register/>)
Submit an event (<http://www.nj.com/myevent/>)

Newspaper stories and photos

The Star-Ledger (<http://www.nj.com/starledger/>) | Subscribe (http://ads.advance.net/RealMedia/ads/click_ix.ads/www.nj.com/Proxy)
The Times of Trenton (<http://www.nj.com/times/>) | Subscribe (http://ads.advance.net/RealMedia/ads/click_ix.ads/www.nj.com/Proxy)
The Jersey Journal (<http://www.nj.com/jjournal/>) | Subscribe (http://ads.advance.net/RealMedia/ads/click_ix.ads/www.nj.com/Proxy)
South Jersey Times (<http://www.nj.com/southjerseytimes/>) | Subscribe (<http://www.nj.com/hunterdon-county-democrat/>)
Hunterdon County Democrat (<http://www.nj.com/hunterdon-county-democrat/>)
Cranford Chronicle (<http://www.nj.com/cranford/>) | Subscribe (<http://www.nj.com/star-gazette/>)
Star Gazette (<http://www.nj.com/warren/>) | Subscribe (<http://www.nj.com/messenger-gazette/>)
The Messenger-Gazette (<http://www.nj.com/messenger-gazette/>)
The Warren Reporter (<http://www.nj.com/warrenreporter/>)
Independent Press (<http://www.nj.com/independentpress/>)
Suburban News (<http://www.nj.com/suburbannews/>)
Learn more about our newspapers (<http://www.nj.com/newspapers/>)

Mobile

Mobile site (<http://mobile.nj.com/>) | iPhone, Android apps (<http://www.nj.com/mobile-device/>) | Tablet apps (<http://www.nj.com/mobile-device/>)

Follow Us

Twitter (<https://twitter.com/njdotcom>) |

Facebook (<http://www.facebook.com/NJ.com>)

Google+

(<https://plus.google.com/u/0/b/103270407631392618549/103270407631392618549/posts>)

| foursquare (<https://foursquare.com/njdotcom>)



(<http://www.advancedigital.com/>)

Registration on or use of this site constitutes acceptance of our [User Agreement](http://www.nj.com/useragreement/) and [Privacy Policy](http://www.nj.com/privacypolicy/) (Revised November 1, 2011)

© 2013 New Jersey On-Line LLC. All rights reserved ([About Us](http://www.nj.com/aboutus/)).

The material on this site may not be reproduced, distributed, transmitted, cached or otherwise used, except with the prior written permission of New Jersey On-Line LLC.

[Community Rules](http://www.nj.com/forums/index.ssf?rules.html) apply to all content you upload or otherwise submit to this site. [Contact interactivity management.](http://www.nj.com/contactus/interactivity.ssf)

[▶ Ad Choices](http://www.advance.net/advancedigitalUserAgreementPP#opt_out)